



Doug Holton ▶ Públic

26 de maig 2014



Some criticisms of the Hattie Visible Learning meta-meta-analysis of educational research findings. <http://academiccomputing.wordpress.com/2013/08/05/book-review-visible-learning/>

See also Invisible Learnings:

https://drive.google.com/file/d/1axOX6QeFu3_93GXUmPABq0v202Z0wgD70Su3YCjr9w1MnL1wngAarwHH6XS/edit?usp=sharing

And this comment by Dylan Willam (author of books and articles on formative assessment) explains more about the problematic use of 'effect sizes':

<http://ollieorange2.wordpress.com/2014/03/18/four-things-you-should-know-about-the-effect-size/comment-page-1/#comment-14>

This other post notes how Hattie's cutoff effect size of 0.40 is misleading. 0.40 is supposed to represent the average gain from one year of schooling. But the gain actually varies based on age/grade. In elementary school, the difference between the highest and lowest achieving students is not that large, meaning the variance is small, which increases the effect size (calculated as post minus pre divided by standard deviation). In later years, the differences between the highest and lowest performing students is very large, and the average gain is much lower than 0.40 starting around when a student is 10 years old.

<http://ollieorange2.wordpress.com/2014/03/10/visible-learning-6-age-and-the-effect-size/>

And more criticisms of the book:

http://literacyinleafstrewn.blogspot.com/2012/12/can-we-trust-educational-research_20.html

And see these articles for criticisms of meta-analyses in general:

http://www.meta-analysis.com/downloads/Intro_Criticisms_optim.pdf

<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19417748>

<http://humrep.oxfordjournals.org/content/29/8/1622.full.pdf>

One other criticism of the Hattie book that the above articles don't mention is that there are different kinds of "learning" and thus different ways of measuring it. There is rote memorization (factual recall), procedural learning (reproducing steps), conceptual learning, transfer, and I would also include things like engagement/motivation/self-efficacy, as that helps predict and drive future learning (what point is an intervention that helps students learn math but makes



The example I've mentioned before is problem-based learning, which Hattie indicates has only a 0.15 effect size, if I recall, which would place it below Hattie's 0.40 threshold. However, that is for factual learning. When looking at measures of transfer and conceptual understanding, however, the effect size is much larger. See for example this meta-synthesis of studies on problem-based learning:

<http://docs.lib.purdue.edu/ijpbl/vol3/iss1/4/>

"Findings indicated that PBL was superior when it comes to long-term retention, skill development and satisfaction of students and teachers, while traditional approaches were more effective for short-term retention as measured by standardized board exams."

Problem-based learning even affects (or doesn't hurt) things like empathy. This article showed that students in engineering & physics had less empathy than students in caring professions. The exception was the computer engineering students, who were taught using problem-based learning:

<http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2013/01/130117084854.htm>

"For computer engineering students, the differences were largely eliminated. The researchers have a theory about why: the computer engineering students are taught with PBL, problem-based learning, which is not the case for the applied physics students. Chato Rasool believes this can influence the degree of empathy."

"In problem-based learning you work in groups a lot. You have to be able to listen to others and accept other people's thoughts and expressions of emotions. Otherwise it won't work."

[Tradueix](#)

Book Review: Visible Learning



Sep '12

Sep '13

Home Schooling

academiccomputing.wordpress.com

X/Y test effect size
(looking for > 0)

8 +1 3

S'ha compartit públicament • [Mostra l'activitat](#)**Mattias Davidsson**

Is the "raw" data that Hattie and others use to calculate their effect sizes available publicly somehow? Sure it would be good for the discussion if re-analysis could be made, ie separating the analysis in terms of age of students, type of comparison being made...

[Tradueix](#)20
d'oct.
2015**Melodye Rooney**

FYI, the mobility factor consists of three meta-analyses, all from the US. The two dealing with school mobility (and residential mobility, not differentiated as far as I can tell) are unpublished PhD theses, one dealing with school achievement for low income, minority children transferring schools with conflating issues, and the largest study (131k of the total 185k students) looks at grade point "transfer shock" when students transfer from community colleges to 4 year universities. How can these studies give an effect size for mobility, when the groups are so different?

[Tradueix](#)24 de
febr.
2016



How to engage in pseudoscience with real data: A criticism of John Hattie's arguments in Visible Learning from the perspective of a statistician <http://mje.mcgill.ca/article/view/9475/7229>

School leadership and the cult of the guru: the neo-Taylorism of Hattie http://scotteacott.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Eacott_SLAM_2017.pdf

[Tradueix](#)



Doug Holton

The school research lead and another nail in the coffin of Hattie's Visible Learning

<http://evidencebasededucationalleadership.blogspot.co.uk/2017/01/the-school-research-lead-and-another.html?m=1>

[Tradueix](#)

43
set.



Doug Holton

An investigation of the evidence John Hattie presents in Visible Learning

visiblelearning.blogspot.com.au - VisibleLearning

VisibleLearning

visiblelearning.blogspot.com.au

[Tradueix](#)

43
set.



Doug Holton

<http://www.darcymoore.net/2017/08/26/cult-hattie-wilful-blindness/>

40
set.



Doug Holton

<https://radicalsolarship.wordpress.com/2013/10/27/teacher-quality-wiggins-and-hattie-more-doing-the-wrong-things-the-right-ways/amp/>

17
set.



INICIA LA SESSIÓ

Seven reasons to question the hegemony of Visible Learning
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/01596306.2018.1480474?journalCode=cdis20>

Tradueix



Afegeix un comentari...